BEFORE THE STATE OF FLORIDA DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

STATE OF FLORIDA DEPARTMENT)	IN THE OFFICE OF THE
OF ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION)	CENTRAL DISTRICT
)	
Complainant,)	
•)	OGC FILE NO. 24-2170
VS.)	
)	
Brevard County, Florida)	
Ž)	
Respondent.)	

CONSENT ORDER

This Consent Order is entered into between the State of Florida Department of Environmental Protection ("Department") and Brevard County, Florida, a political subdivision of the State of Florida, ("Respondent") to reach settlement of certain matters at issue between the Department and Respondent.

In order for the parties to reach a resolution regarding the allegations contained herein, the Department finds and the Respondent neither admits nor denies the following:

- 1. The Department is the administrative agency of the State of Florida having the power and duty to protect Florida's air and water resources and to administer and enforce Chapter 373, Part IV, and Chapter 403, Florida Statutes, and the rules promulgated and authorized thereunder, Title 62, Florida Administrative Code. In addition, the Department is specifically authorized to administer and enforce the provisions of Sections 403.9321-9333, Florida Statutes, the "Mangrove Trimming and Preservation Act." The Department has jurisdiction over the matters addressed in this Consent Order.
- 2. Respondent is a person within the meaning of Section 403.031(5), Florida Statutes.

- 3. Respondent conducted the activities described in Paragraph four (4) below on the following parcels: 1935 S Banana River Drive, Merritt Island, FL 32952, further identified by Parcel ID 25-37-07-00-786, given by the Brevard County Property Appraiser, further identified by ERP Site ID 241016, given by the Department; 1865 S Banana River Drive and 1895 S Banana River Drive, Merritt Island, FL 32952, further identified by Parcel IDs 25-37-07-00-787 and 25-37-07-00-783, respectively, given by the Brevard County Property Appraiser, further identified by ERP Site ID 347714, given by the Department; Parcel ID 25-37-07-00-792 given by the Brevard County Property Appraiser; Parcel ID 25-37-07-00-759, given by the Brevard County Property Appraiser; 1845 S Banana River Drive, further identified by Parcel ID 25-37-07-00-784, given by the Brevard County Property Appraiser; and 1857 Harley Place, further identified by Parcel ID 25-37-07-00-780, given by the Brevard County Property Appraiser. The approximate area of the activities described in Paragraph 4 below is further identified by ERP site ID 429528. The identified properties are adjacent to the Brevard County Old Causeway Road Outfall Ditch, which is connected to the Banana River, an Outstanding Florida Water, as established by state law, and an aquatic preserve, the Banana River Aquatic Preserve. Brevard County is not the owner of record for any of the above-listed properties. The use of the term "Ditch" throughout this Consent Order is strictly to generally identify the impacted area and for ease of reference.
- 4. Respondent altered mangroves below six feet without authorization from the Department on either side of the Old Causeway Outfall Ditch. Mangroves were cut to the stumps, with complete defoliation occurring. See the inspection report and Warning Letter issued on January 5, 2023, attached hereto and incorporated herein as Attachment A. The area impacted by the Respondent totals approximately 0.39 acres, as depicted on Exhibit A.

Having reached a resolution of the matter Respondent and the Department mutually agree and it is,

ORDERED:

5. Respondent shall implement the Restoration Actions attached hereto and incorporated herein as Attachment B and the Maintenance and Monitoring Actions
SLERP/CO 11/2022

attached hereto and incorporated herein as Attachment C in the manner and within the time frames specified therein.

- 6. With the exception of the activities described in the Restoration Actions, effective immediately and henceforth, Respondent shall not alter mangroves without first obtaining a valid Department permit or written notification from the Department that the activities appear to be exempt as proposed from Department permitting requirements, unless such activity is otherwise exempt pursuant to Florida law; nor shall Respondent conduct any activities on State-owned lands below the ordinary or mean high water lines without first obtaining a lease, easement, or other consent of use from the Department, unless such activity is otherwise exempt pursuant to Florida law.
- 7. Once the Restoration Actions have been completed, the Respondent shall implement the Maintenance and Monitoring Actions attached hereto and incorporated herein as Attachment C in the manner and within the time frames specified therein.
- 8. Respondent agrees to pay the Department stipulated penalties in the amount of \$1,000 per day for each and every day Respondent fails to timely comply with any of the requirements of Paragraphs 5, 6, and 7 of this Consent Order. A separate stipulated penalty shall be assessed for each violation of this Order upon written notice to the Respondent of the alleged violation. Within 30 days of said written notice from the Department, Respondent shall either: (1) dispute the violation or (2) agree to the violation and make payment of the appropriate stipulated penalties to the "The Department of Environmental Protection" by cashier's check or money order and shall include thereon the OGC number assigned to this Consent Order and the notation "Water Quality Assurance Trust Fund." The Department may make demands for payment at any time after violations occur in accordance with the above. Nothing in this Paragraph shall prevent the Department from filing suit to specifically enforce any of the terms of this Consent Order. If the Department is required to file a lawsuit to recover stipulated penalties under this Paragraph, the Department will not be foreclosed from seeking civil penalties for violations of this Consent Order in an amount greater than the stipulated penalties due under this Paragraph.
- 9. If any event, including administrative or judicial challenges by third SLERP/CO 11/2022

parties unrelated to the Respondent, occurs which causes delay or the reasonable likelihood of delay, in complying with the requirements of this Consent Order, Respondent shall have the burden of proving the delay was or will be caused by circumstances beyond the reasonable control of the Respondent and could not have been or cannot be overcome by Respondent's due diligence. Economic circumstances shall not be considered circumstances beyond the control of Respondent, nor shall the failure of a contractor, subcontractor, materialman or other agent (collectively referred to as "contractor") to whom responsibility for performance is delegated to meet contractually imposed deadlines be a cause beyond the control of Respondent, unless the cause of the contractor's late performance was also beyond the contractor's control. Upon occurrence of an event causing delay, or upon becoming aware of a potential for delay, Respondent shall notify the Department orally within 24 hours or by the next working day and shall, within seven calendar days of oral notification to the Department, notify the Department in writing of the anticipated length and cause of the delay, the measures taken or to be taken to prevent or minimize the delay and the timetable by which Respondent intends to implement these measures. If the parties can agree that the delay or anticipated delay has been or will be caused by circumstances beyond the reasonable control of Respondent, the time for performance hereunder shall be extended for a period equal to the agreed delay resulting from such circumstances. Such agreement shall adopt all reasonable measures necessary to avoid or minimize delay. Failure of Respondent to comply with the notice requirements of this Paragraph in a timely manner shall constitute a waiver of Respondent's right to request an extension of time for compliance with the requirements of this Consent Order.

- 10. Entry of this Consent Order does not relieve Respondent of the need to comply with applicable Federal, State or local laws, regulations or ordinances.
- 11. The terms and conditions set forth in this Consent Order may be enforced in a court of competent jurisdiction pursuant to Sections 120.69 and 373.129, Florida Statutes. Failure to comply with the terms of this Consent Order shall constitute a violation of Section 373.430, Florida Statutes.
- 12. Respondent is fully aware that a violation of the terms of this Consent SLERP/CO 11/2022

Order may subject Respondent to judicial imposition of damages, civil penalties of up to \$15,000 per day per violation and administrative fines of up to \$10,000 per day per violation and criminal penalties.

13. Persons who are not parties to this Consent Order but whose substantial interests are affected by this Consent Order have a right, pursuant to Sections 120.569 and 120.57, Florida Statutes, to petition for an administrative hearing on it. The Petition must contain the information set forth below and must be filed (received) at the Department's Office of General Counsel, 3900 Commonwealth Boulevard, MS-35, Tallahassee, Florida 32399-3000, or received via electronic correspondence at Agency Clerk@floridadep.gov, within 21 days of receipt of this notice. A copy of the Petition must also be mailed at the time of filing to the District Office named above at the address indicated. Failure to file a petition within the 21 days constitutes a waiver of any right such person has to an administrative hearing pursuant to Sections 120.569 and 120.57, Florida Statutes.

The petition shall contain the following information:

- a) The name and address of each agency affected and each agency's file or identification number, if known;
- b) The name, address, any e-mail address, any facsimile number, and telephone number of the petitioner, if the petitioner is not represented by an attorney or a qualified representative; the name, address, and telephone number of the petitioner's representative, if any, which shall be the address for service purposes during the course of the proceeding; and an explanation of how the petitioner's substantial interests will be affected by the agency determination;
- c) A statement of when and how the petitioner received notice of the agency decision;
- d) A statement of all disputed issues of material fact. If there are none, the petition must so indicate;
- e) A concise statement of the ultimate facts alleged, including the specific facts the petitioner contends warrant reversal or modification of the agency's

proposed action;

- f) A statement of the specific rules or statutes the petitioner contends require reversal or modification of the agency's proposed action, including an explanation of how the alleged facts relate to the specific rules or statutes; and
- g) A statement of the relief sought by the petitioner, stating precisely the action petitioner wishes the agency to take with respect to the agency's proposed action.

If a petition is filed, the administrative hearing process is designed to formulate agency action. Accordingly, the Department's final action may be different from the position taken by it in this Notice. Persons whose substantial interests will be affected by any decision of the Department with regard to the subject Consent Order have the right to petition to become a party to the proceeding. The petition must conform to the requirements specified above and be filed (received) within 21 days of receipt of this notice in the Office of General Counsel at the above address of the Department. Failure to petition within the allowed time frame constitutes a waiver of any right such person has to request a hearing under Sections 120.569 and 120.57, Florida Statutes, and to participate as a party to this proceeding. Any subsequent intervention will only be at the approval of the presiding officer upon motion filed pursuant to Rule 28-106.205, Florida Administrative Code.

A person whose substantial interests are affected by the Consent Order may file a timely petition for an administrative hearing under Sections 120.569 and 120.57, Florida Statutes, or may choose to pursue mediation as an alternative remedy under Section 120.573, Florida Statutes, before the deadline for filing a petition. Choosing mediation will not adversely affect the right to a hearing if mediation does not result in a settlement. The procedures for pursuing mediation are set forth below.

Mediation may only take place if the Department and all the parties to the proceeding agree that mediation is appropriate. A person may pursue mediation by

reaching a mediation agreement with all parties to the proceeding (which include the Respondent, the Department, and any person who has filed a timely and sufficient petition for a hearing) and by showing how the substantial interests of each mediating party are affected by the Consent Order. The agreement must be filed in (received by) the Office of General Counsel of the Department at 3900 Commonwealth Boulevard, Mail Station 35, Tallahassee, Florida 32399-3000, or received via electronic correspondence at Agency_Clerk@floridadep.gov, within 10 days after the deadline as set forth above for the filing of a petition.

The agreement to mediate must include the following:

- (a) The names, addresses, and telephone numbers of any persons who may attend the mediation;
- (b) The name, address, and telephone number of the mediator selected by the parties, or a provision for selecting a mediator within a specified time;
 - (c) The agreed allocation of the costs and fees associated with the mediation;
- (d) The agreement of the parties on the confidentiality of discussions and documents introduced during mediation;
- (e) The date, time, and place of the first mediation session, or a deadline for holding the first session, if no mediator has yet been chosen;
- (f) The name of each party's representative who shall have authority to settle or recommend settlement; and
- (g) Either an explanation of how the substantial interests of each mediating party will be affected by the action or proposed action addressed in this notice of intent or a statement clearly identifying the petition for hearing that each party has already filed, and incorporating it by reference.
 - (h) The signatures of all parties or their authorized representatives.

As provided in Section 120.573, Florida Statutes, the timely agreement of all parties to mediate will toll the time limitations imposed by Sections 120.569 and 120.57, Florida Statutes, for requesting and holding an administrative hearing. Unless otherwise agreed by the parties, the mediation must be concluded within sixty days of

the execution of the agreement. If mediation results in settlement of the administrative dispute, the Department must enter a final order incorporating the agreement of the parties. Persons whose substantial interests will be affected by such a modified final decision of the Department have a right to petition for a hearing only in accordance with the requirements for such petitions set forth above, and must therefore file their petitions within 21 days of receipt of this notice. If mediation terminates without settlement of the dispute, the Department shall notify all parties in writing that the administrative hearing processes under Sections 120.569 and 120.57, Florida Statutes, remain available for disposition of the dispute, and the notice will specify the deadlines that then will apply for challenging the agency action and electing remedies under those two statutes.

- 14. The Department hereby expressly reserves the right to initiate appropriate legal action to prevent or prohibit any violations of applicable statutes, or the rules promulgated thereunder that are not specifically addressed by the terms of this Consent Order.
- 15. The Department, for and in consideration of the complete and timely performance by Respondent of the obligations agreed to in this Consent Order, hereby waives its right to seek judicial imposition of damages or civil penalties for alleged violations addressed in this Consent Order.
- 16. Respondent acknowledges and waives its right to an administrative hearing pursuant to Sections 120.569 and 120.57, Florida Statutes, on the terms of this Consent Order. Respondent acknowledges its right to appeal the terms of this Consent Order pursuant to Section 120.68, Florida Statutes, and waives that right upon signing this Consent Order. However, Respondent does not waive its right to contest or challenge subsequent enforcement of this Consent Order.
- 17. Electronic signatures or other versions of the parties' signatures, such as .pdf or facsimile, shall be valid and have the same force and effect as originals. No modifications of the terms of this Consent Order shall be effective until reduced to writing and executed by both Respondent and the Department.

- 18. All submittals and payments required by this Consent Order to be submitted to the Department shall be sent to the Florida Department of Environmental Protection, 3319 Maguire Boulevard, Suite 232, Orlando, FL 32803.
- 19. This Consent Order is a settlement of the Department's civil and administrative authority arising under Florida law to resolve the matters addressed herein. This Consent Order is not a settlement of any criminal liabilities which may arise under Florida law, nor is it a settlement of any violation which may be prosecuted criminally or civilly under federal law.
- 20. This Consent Order is a final order of the Department pursuant to Section 120.52(7), Florida Statutes, and it is final and effective on the date filed with the Clerk of the Department unless a Petition for Administrative Hearing is filed in accordance with Chapter 120, Florida Statutes. Upon the timely filing of a petition this Consent Order will not be effective until further order of the Department.

	FOR THE RESPONDENT:
DATE	Signature
	Marc E. Bernath, Public Works Director Brevard County, Florida

As approved by the Board on August 12, 2025

FOR DEPARTMENT USE ONLY

DON Flori		day of	, 2025, in Orange County,
			STATE OF FLORIDA DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION
			Aaron Watkins District Director
	d, on this date, pursuant to S k, receipt of which is hereb		2, F.S., with the designated Department ged.
	Clerk	_	Date
cc:	Lea Crandall, Agency Cler Mail Station 35	k	

ATTACHMENT A: WARNING LETTER AND INSPECTION REPORT



FLORIDA DEPARTMENT OF Environmental Protection

Ron DeSantis Governor

Jeanette Nuñez Lt. Governor

Shawn Hamilton Secretary

Central District Office 3319 Maguire Blvd., Suite 232 Orlando, Florida 32803

January 19, 2023

Marc Bernath, Director Brevard County Public Works 2725 Judge Fran Jamieson Way Viera, FL 32940 Public Works Office @ Brevard FL.gov

Re: Warning Letter

Old Causeway Road Outfall Ditch

ERP Site ID # 429528 Brevard County

Dear Mr. Bernath:

An inspection was conducted at your site on December 16, 2022. During this inspection, possible violations of Chapter 403, Florida Statutes (F.S.) were observed.

During the inspection Department personnel noted the following:

• Approximately 0.1 acres of mangroves had been altered without authorization

Violations of Florida Statutes or administrative rules may result in liability for damages and restoration, and the judicial imposition of civil penalties, pursuant to Sections 403.9328 Florida Statutes.

Please contact Charlie Nolan, at 407-897-2913, within **7 days** of receipt of this Warning Letter to arrange a meeting to discuss this matter. The Department is interested in receiving any facts you may have that will assist in determining whether any violations have occurred. You may bring anyone with you to the meeting that you feel could help resolve this matter.

Please be advised that this Warning Letter is part of an agency investigation, preliminary to agency action in accordance with Section 120.57(5), Florida Statutes. We look forward to your cooperation in completing the investigation and resolving this matter.

Sincerely,

Aaron Watkins, Director

Dan Watto

Central District

Florida Department of Environmental Protection

AW/dkh/cn

Enclosures: Inspection Report (with attachments)

cc: FDEP: Charlie Nolan, Sean Boyles, Alton Smith, Daniel Hall, Jason Seyfert



Florida Department of Environmental Protection

CENTRAL DISTRICT COMPLIANCE ASSURANCE PROGRAM

ERP Program Inspection Report

Lead DEP Inspector: Charlie Nolan	$\Box \text{ Compliance } \Box \text{ Enforcement}$ $\Box \text{ Other: } \underline{N/A}$	
Complaint No. 8377 ERP Site No. 429528	CE Project No. 407779	
Owner/Responsible Party: Marc Bernath, Dire County Public Works	ector of Brevard <u>Contact:</u> PublicWorksOffice@BrevardFL.gov	
Location: Old Causeway Road Outfall Ditch, M	Ierritt Island. GPS Coordinates: 28°19'29.56"N, 80°39'36.69"W	
Waterbody: Banana River Below 520 Causewa Class: □ I □ III □ IV □ V OFW: □ Yes ☒ No Aquatic Preserve: □ Yes ☒ No State Lands: □ Yes ☒ No	Shellfish Harvesting: Approved Conditionally Approved Conditionally Restricted Prohibited Aquatic Preserve Name: N/A Lease/Easement No.: N/A SSL Lease Inspection completed: N/A	
Site History & Inspection Overview		
Site History: The above referenced site has no prior permitting or compliance history with the Florida Department of Environmental Protection (FDEP). Site Inspection Overview: On November 11, 2022, a complaint was received by an anonymous source that there were potential dredge and fill impacts as well as mangrove removal on 1901 Old Causeway Road and additional mangrove removal on the lots to the north and to the east.		
An additional complaint was received on November 30, 2022, by Brevard County Natural Resources that alleged dredging, and mangrove impacts specifically at 1865 S Banana River Drive, along with 1895 S Banana River Drive and 1935 S Banana River Drive. Another complaint was received on December 1, 2022, from an anonymous source that was forwarded to FDEP from the Florida Fish and Wildlife Commission that alleged canal dredging and mangrove impacts at 1865, 1895, and 1935 S Banana River Drive. 1865 S. Banana River Drive and 1901 Old Causeway Road are contiguous sides of the same property sitting at the intersection of Old Causeway Road and Banana River Drive		
Compliance Status: ☐ In Compliance ☐ Mino	or Non-Compliance 🗵 Significant Non-Compliance	

Resource Assessment

FLUCCS/FNAI Community Type(s):	4340: Upland Mixed - Coniferous / Hardwood	
Wetlands/Other Surface Waters (OSW) Present:	⊠ Yes □ No	
Waters of the United States (WOTUS) Present:		
Other Resources Present:	⊠ Yes □ No	
	If "Yes," identify: Avicennia germinans, Laguncularia	
	racemosa	
Resource Impacts:	⊠ Yes □ No	
Area of Authorized Impacts (ft ²):	N/A	
Area of Unauthorized Impacts (ft²):	Approximately 4,327 square feet or 0.1 acres	

MANGROVES

Total Length of Shoreline (ft.):	Approximately 240 feet	
Length of Mangrove Fringe (ft.):	147 feet on the east side of the ditch, 445 feet on the west side of the ditch.	
Depth of Mangrove Fringe (ft.):	Unable to be measured.	
Mangroves Trimmed:	☐ Yes ☒ No	
Mangroves Altered:	⊠ Yes □ No 25%	
Pre-Impact Height:	☐ <6 ft. ☐ 6-10 ft. ☐ 10-16 ft. ☐ 16-24 ft. ☐ >24 ft. ☑ Unknown	
Post-Impact Height:	⊠ <6 ft. □ 6-10 ft. □ 10-16 ft. □ 16-24 ft. □ >24 ft.	
Average Diameter at Breast Height (DBH):	□ <1" □ 1-3" □ 3-5" □ 5-7" □ >7" 図 Unknown	
Percent Canopy Cover by Species:	0% RED 50% BLK 50% WHT 0% OTHER: <u>N/A</u>	

Impact Description:

Based on historic images from Google Street View, both black mangroves (*Avicennia germinans*) and white mangroves (*Laguncularia racemosa*) can be seen on either side of the Old Causeway Road drainage ditch. Evidence of black mangrove pneumatophores can also be seen in the post-impact images taken on December 16, 2022. Un-altered mangroves remain further inland on either side of the ditch, with both white mangroves and black mangroves being observed.

Access to the shoreline of the ditch was impeded by water and so field-measurements were unable to be taken. Using aerial imagery and Google Street View imagery, it was determined that two areas of approximately 120 feet long and 20 feet wide were cleared of mangroves and other vegetation on either side of the drainage ditch.

Investigation Summary

On December 16, 2022, FDEP staff Charlie Nolan, Sean Boyles, and Alton Smith went to inspect multiple properties on Merritt Island for mangrove impacts, including 1865 Old Causeway Road, 1895 S Banana River Drive, and 1935 S Banana River Drive. Impacts continued north, past these addresses into a portion of the canal inaccessible to FDEP staff. From the road, vegetation was seen cleared on both sides of the ditch, with living white and black mangroves on either side and pneumatophores from black mangroves observed in the water.

Jeff Cooke, from Brevard County Natural Resources, was met with on-site for the inspections of 1865, 1895, and 1935 S Banana River Drive, but was denied access to the sites by the property owner. After the inspection he confirmed that Brevard County had been performing maintenance dredging and vegetation clearing within the drainage ditch. Photographs of the work were provided to FDEP and showed the extent of mangrove alteration within the northern portion of the Old Causeway drainage ditch.

SIGNIFICANT NON-COMPLIANCE DESCRIPTION:

• 0.1 acres of unauthorized mangrove alteration

Statute/Rule Reference(s):

• Chapter 403.9328 F.S.	
Follow-Up Action: Reply to the attached Warning Letter	
Supporting Documentation Attached:	
☑ Figures such as maps, diagrams, and/or aerial imagery	
☐ Chapter 62-340, F.A.C. Data Form(s)	
☐ WOTUS Determination Documentation	
☐ UMAM Documentation	
☐ SSL Lease Inspection Report	
☐ Other: <u>N/A</u>	
Charlie M. Nolom	1/04/2023
Charlie Nolan, Environmental Specialist I	Date
Janes Kthel	1/25/2023
Daniel Hall, Environmental Manager	Date

ERP Site Inspection Figures
Inspection Date: 12/16/2022
Lead DEP Inspector: Charlie Nolan

Brevard County Mangrove Impacts

Mangrove Impacts

Old Causeway Rd

Google Earth

Figure 1: Image shows the approximate area of mangrove impacts along the Old Causeway Road drainage ditch.

ERP Site Inspection Photos
Inspection Date: 12/16/2022
Lead DEP Inspector: Charlie Nolan



Photo 1: Photograph taken facing north into the Old Causeway Road drainage ditch. Image was taken by Brevard County employee David Kain on June 9, 2022. Both shorelines were cleared of vegetation, including mangroves.



Photo 2: Photograph taken facing north into the Old Causeway Road drainage ditch. This image was taken during the inspection on December 16, 2022. Both sides of the ditch remain clear of vegetation, but some saplings of unknown species are beginning to re-establish on the eastern shore.



Photo 3: Photograph was taken facing north towards the eastern shoreline of the Old Causeway Road drainage ditch. The new growth can be seen, as well as the remnant pneumatophores from black mangroves.



Photo 4: Photograph taken facing northwest towards the western shoreline of the Old Causeway Road drainage ditch. Pneumatophores from black mangroves can be seen in the water as well as living white mangroves and Brazilian pepper (Schinus terebinthifolia).



Photo 5: Photograph taken facing north into the Old Causeway Road drainage ditch. Image came from Google Street View and was take in June of 2019. Mangroves can be seen growing along the shoreline of the ditch on either side.



Photo 6: Photograph taken facing northwest into the Old Causeway Road drainage ditch. This image was taken from Google Street View and was photographed in May of 2011. Black and white mangroves can be seen growing along the ditch, with black mangrove pneumatophores present in the same location as in the December 16, 2022, site inspection photos.

ATTACHMENT B: RESTORATION ACTIONS

- 1. Unless otherwise stated herein, within 120 days of the effective date of this Order, Respondent shall complete the following Restoration Actions:
 - a. Respondent shall notify the Department at least 48 hours prior to the commencement of any Restoration Actions within the Restoration Areas.
 - b. Any re-grading or planting activities conducted by the Respondent in the Restoration Areas shall be completed in a manner so as not to negatively affect wetland areas outside the Restoration Areas.
 - c. As necessary, prior to any Restoration Actions, Respondent will receive permission from the private property owners of the sites specified in Paragraph 3 of the Consent Order to conduct required Restoration Actions. Should any property owners deny Respondent access to perform required Restoration Actions, Respondent will notify the Department in writing within seven (7) days which parcels denied property access. Repeated documented denial of access to the property by the property owner may be grounds for relief from Respondent's Restoration Actions at the Department's sole discretion.
 - d. REMOVAL OF NUISANCE AND EXOTIC VEGETATION: Respondent shall remove all exotic and nuisance vegetation within Restoration Areas A and B, as shown in Exhibit A, specifically being 15 feet from the top of bank of the Old Causeway Outfall ditch, as shown in Exhibit A. Nuisance and exotic vegetation includes Brazilian Peppertree (*Schinus terebinthifolia*), seaside mahoe (*Thespesia populnea*), and any plant listed on the Florida Noxious Weeds list (F.A.C. 5B-57) or the Prohibited Aquatic Plants list (F.A.C. 5B-64).
 - i. Nuisance and exotic vegetation shall be removed using equipment in a manner that will minimize impacts to the existing wetland plants and will not cause ruts in the wetland soils which will impede or divert the flow of surface waters.

- ii. The stumps of exotic plants within the restoration area shall be treated during the duration of this Consent Order to prevent regrowth, with an appropriate systemic herbicide approved by the Department in advance.
- iii. Vegetative debris generated from the removal of nuisance and exotic vegetation shall be removed from the Restoration Areas and placed within an upland location that will not result in debris washing into wetlands or surface waters.
- iv. Removal of nuisance and exotic vegetation shall occur before any planting, as required, can take place.
- e. The Respondent shall be permitted one (1) year from the date of execution of this Consent Order to allow natural recruitment of mangroves in **Restoration Area A and B** to obtain 80% aerial coverage of mangroves. Respondent may plant mangroves at any time should the natural recruitment not be sufficient to reach 80% aerial coverage. Should the aerial coverage of mangrove species not reach 80% within this one-year period, the Department shall issue a replanting plan. The replanting plan shall be implemented by the Respondent no later than 90 days after receipt of the plan, unless otherwise specified in the replanting plan.

f. PLANTING OF MANGROVES WITHIN RESTORATION AREA C

- i. Respondent shall only be required to complete the mangrove plantings and restoration actions within Restoration Area C once the dredged area has been restored. Respondent shall complete the mangrove plantings within 120 days of Restoration Area C being restored by the private property owners.
- ii. Respondent is to plant one-hundred thirty-three (133) mangroves within Restoration Area C within 15 feet from the top of bank of the

Old Causeway Outfall Ditch. In order to mimic appropriate natural mangrove recruitment, the plantings shall be done as follows:

- 1. Fifty-eight (58) red mangroves (*Rhizophora mangle*) planted at roughly five-foot (5') centers along the Ditch and most waterward;
- 2. Twenty-six (26) black mangroves (*Avicennia germinans*) planted at roughly twelve-foot (12') centers being planted behind the red mangroves (*Rhizophora mangle*); and
- 3. Forty-nine (49) white mangroves (*Laguncularia racemosa*) planted at roughly six-foot (6') centers behind the black mangroves (*Avicennia germinans*).
- iii. Respondent's plantings shall not be considered to resolve any wetlands impacts caused by private property owners.
- iv. Field adjustments to the type, size, placement and numbers of mangroves may be needed. Any adjustments will require written approval from the Department.
- v. The mangroves shall be at least one-gallon, well-rooted, nursery-grown stock. If Respondent is unable to purchase such stock, the Respondent may seek written approval from the Department for smaller or alternate plantings to achieve the same or similar planting coverage with appropriate spacing based on size.
- vi. If the private property owner(s) within Restoration Area C receive authorization from the Department to keep the dredged impacts, then the Respondent shall be relieved of its obligations to plant mangroves within Restoration Area C.
- vii. Should any property owners deny Respondent access to perform required Restoration Actions, Respondent will notify the

Department in writing within seven (7) days which parcels denied property access. Repeated documented denial of access to the property by the property owner may be grounds for relief from Respondent's Restoration Actions within Restoration Area C at the Department's sole discretion.

- 2. Within thirty (30) days of completion of these Restoration Actions, Respondent shall submit the following information to the Department:
 - a. Written notification that the Restoration Actions have been completed.
 - b. Enough color photographs to show the entire completed Restoration Areas taken from fixed reference points shown on a plan-view drawing.
 - c. Number and spacing of each species of mangrove planted, as applicable.
- 3. The Parties hereto acknowledge that Respondent has no control over the conditions of Restoration Area C identified in Exhibit A, including, but not limited to, the quality of the soil and adequacy of irrigation. Respondent shall only become responsible for planting mangroves in Restoration Area C if such area is restored by the private property owners.
 - a. If the private property owners within Restoration Area C receive authorization from the Department and other relevant regulatory agencies, as required, to keep the dredged impact, then the Respondent shall be relieved of its obligations to plant mangroves within Restoration Area C.
 - b. Should the private property owners of Restoration Area C agree to implement a Restoration Plan, as approved by the Department, then the Respondent shall be relieved of its obligations to plant mangroves within Restoration Area C.

ATTACHMENT C: MAINTENANCE AND MONITORING ACTIONS

Unless otherwise stated herein, within 90 days of the completion of the Restoration Actions in each corresponding Restoration Area, Respondent shall implement the following Maintenance and Monitoring Actions:

- 1. For 5 years following completion of the Restoration Actions, Respondent shall inspect Restoration Area semi-annually for the first year and annually for all following years.
 - a. Should the property owners of Restoration Areas B and C agree to perform the required maintenance and monitoring, then the Respondent shall not be responsible for maintenance and monitoring for Restoration Areas B and C. This agreement shall be provided to and agreed upon by the Department prior to the Respondent being relieved of responsibility.
 - b. The purpose of the monitoring shall be to determine the success of the restoration, as defined in Paragraph 2, below.
 - c. If any of the Restoration Areas meet the success criteria as defined in Paragraph 2 prior to the expiration of the 5-year monitoring period, then the Respondent shall provide written notice to the Department with evidence supporting such a finding.
 - d. The Department shall inspect the Restoration Area to confirm that the Restoration Area meets the success criteria, as defined in Paragraph 2, below. Should the success criteria be met, the Department shall release the Respondent from further Maintenance and Monitoring requirements for that respective Restoration Area.
- 2. "Success of the restoration" means that at the end of the monitoring schedule, as applicable, the following success criteria are met in the Restoration Areas required in the Restoration Actions.

- a. The respective restoration area shall achieve at least 80% aerial coverage of mangroves. Deceased mangroves shall not count towards the aerial coverage percentage.
- b. The respective restoration area shall have less than 10% aerial coverage of nuisance and exotic vegetation, which includes Brazilian Peppertree (*Schinus terebinthifolia*), seaside mahoe (*Thespesia populnea*), and any plant listed on the Florida Noxious Weeds list (F.A.C. 5B-57) or the Prohibited Aquatic Plants list (F.A.C. 5B-64).
- 3. Within thirty (30) days after the completion of each inspection in the monitoring schedule, as applicable, Respondent shall complete a monitoring report and submit it to the Department. The monitoring reports shall include the following information:
 - a. Date of the inspection.
 - b. Color photographs taken from the same locations as the pictures taken in the Restoration Actions completion report.
 - c. Statistically valid estimate of the percent aerial coverage of each mangrove species that exists in each Restoration Area. Statistically valid estimating methods include those found in Daubenmire, R. (1968), Oosting (1956), or Mueller-Dombois and Ellenberg (1974), or other method approved by the Department. More information on these methods will be provided by the Department upon request.
 - d. Description of any nuisance or exotic species removed.
- 4. Should any of the Restoration Areas not meet the success criteria after the 5-year Maintenance and Monitoring Period, the Department shall issue additional restoration actions to be completed by the Respondent
 - a. The Department-issued plan will include additional mangrove plantings sufficient to achieve the required 80% coverage within the five-year

period.

Exhibit A



Figure 1: Figure shows the three restoration areas, A, B, and C. Note that the dredging activity performed in Restoration Area C was not performed by the Respondent and the activity is being addressed through a separate consent order process to the responsible parties, see OGC cases 24-2168 and 24-2169.